

September 2011

# Status of Sustainable Practices:

## A Survey of North Coast San Diego Cities



## **Introduction**

Sustaining and improving the quality of life is an aspiration of most citizens of our North Coast San Diego region. Achieving the goal of creating sustainable communities can best be accomplished at the local level, rather than the state or federal levels. What are sustainable communities? They are cities whose policies and strategies are designed to meet the social, economic and environmental needs of the present, without compromising the needs of future generations.

In order to monitor the status of sustainable activities in the cities within our league's geographic area, in the fall of 2010 we ran our second biennial survey of sustainability practices. We were pleased that the cities of Carlsbad, Del Mar, Encinitas, Oceanside, Solana Beach and Vista again chose to participate in our survey.

The survey was comprised of 23 questions that covered 8 action areas, which were considered important measures of sustainability efforts. The areas were: Green House gases; Planning; Water Conservation; Governance; Innovation; Solid Waste; Environmental Stewardship and Community Involvement. The questions were posed as yes or no answers with requests for elaboration. This format was utilized to enable better comparisons of each city's efforts. This format will also facilitate our ability to monitor future progress in sustainable efforts.

In the following report, we will reveal the survey results and discuss comparisons between the cities and note novel approaches taken by some of the cities. The cities vary in their population size as well as operating budgets, and consequently differ in their ability to implement sustainability efforts. (see appendix 2). We will also discuss, where possible, differences from our earlier 2008 survey. The complete report and results can be found using the following link: [www.lwvncsd.org/sustainabilityreport2010](http://www.lwvncsd.org/sustainabilityreport2010)

## **Methods**

The methods used to implement the survey are described in the appendices on page 14.

## Greenhouse Gases (GHG) Action Area

<b>QUESTION GH1 – In the past two years has your city carried out a GHG inventory, developed or implemented a plan to reduce GHG emissions? If yes, what GHG measurement methodology was used, and as a result what plans does your city have to reduce GHG emissions?</b>	
<b>Carlsbad</b>	<b>Yes</b> - For government operations, the Local Government Operations Protocol adopted by CARB in 2008 was used. For community emissions, ICLEI's IEAP was used. There are no immediate plans to reduce GHG emissions.
<b>Del Mar</b>	<b>Yes</b> - Currently, the City is participating in a Greenhouse Gas Inventory for 2005 Baseline Data
<b>Encinitas</b>	<b>Yes</b> - The City conducted their GHG inventory in conjunction with ICLEI. As a part of our Comprehensive General Plan Update process a Climate Action Plan has been developed and is scheduled to be presented to the City Council in March.
<b>Oceanside</b>	<b>No, in process</b> - In conjunction with the San Diego Foundation and Local Governments for Sustainability, the City is currently pursuing a GHG inventory. The inventory is expected to be completed by February 2011. To calculate GHG emissions from City operations, the inventory will employ the Local Government Operations Protocol (LGOP) developed by the California Air Resources Board, the California Climate Action Registry, ICLEI and the Climate Registry.
<b>Solana Beach</b>	<b>Yes</b> - The City conducted a GHG Baseline Emissions Inventory utilizing the CARB approved Local Government Operations Protocol (LGOP) developed by ICLEI. GHG reduction targets will be developed and incorporated into the General Plan update scheduled to begin in 2011.
<b>Vista</b>	<b>Yes</b> - Vista has developed an emissions inventory, but have not implemented a plan to reduce GHG emissions. We have secured EECBG funding for the preparation of a Climate Action Plan and plan to issue an RFP early next year with an anticipated completion date of summer 2012.

In 2006 California passed AB32, the Global Warming Solutions Act that mandated a reduction of GHG emission to 1990 levels by 2020. Compliance with this mandate necessitates determining the GHG inventory to set a baseline and establish reduction targets. In 2008, Carlsbad was the only city to have a GHG inventory of its city emissions. In the two intervening years, five of six cities have carried out their GHG inventories, and the sixth city, Oceanside expected completion of their GHG inventory in February of 2011. Most of the cities utilized the Local Government Operations Protocol (LGOP) method that is approved by the California Air Resources Board (CARB), and developed by ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability. Most of the cities plan to utilize the GHG inventory information to create GHG reduction targets to be articulated in their general plans or Climate Action Plans in the future. It is anticipated the GHG target reduction will meet or exceed those mandated by the 2006 Assembly Bill 32.

<b>QUESTION GH2 - Does your city have traffic coordination programs in progress or in the works?</b>	
<b>Carlsbad</b>	<b>Yes</b> - The city's main corridors have traffic signal coordination plans, with upgrades scheduled in upcoming years.
<b>Del Mar</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Encinitas</b>	<b>Yes</b> - Signalization. All major corridors have signal coordination plans. The City utilizes a computerized program called QuickNet, a traffic signal coordination software.
<b>Oceanside</b>	<b>Yes</b> - The City's existing automated time-based coordination system is moving toward real-time signal phasing with the development of the Traffic Management Center, which will enable City staff to remotely monitor and respond to traffic conditions.
<b>Solana Beach</b>	<b>Yes</b> - The City has a traffic coordination program along Highway 101 and Lomas Santa Fe Drive. This program is connected to a traffic management computer at City Hall and is regionally connected to SANDAG's RAMs program
<b>Vista</b>	<b>Yes</b> - There are signal coordination plans on all arterial and major roads, which are updated every two to three years.

## Greenhouse Gases (GHG) Action Area - *continued*

Traffic coordination programs can lead to a reduction of both GHG emissions and traffic congestion. It therefore creates positive environmental, social and economic benefits. Five of the six cities stated they have programs in place or plans for implementation. Encinitas utilizes a computerized system to manage traffic signals. Oceanside's existing automated system is moving toward a real-time system that will allow for remote monitoring and response to real-time traffic conditions. Solana Beach has a traffic program that coordinates traffic along Highway 101 and their main arterial, Lomas Santa Fe Road. The Solana Beach program is connected to a computer at City Hall that in turn is connected to SANDAG's Regional Arterial Management System. Vista has signal coordination plans in place for all arterials and major roads that is updated every two to three years. Currently, Del Mar does not have any traffic coordination plans in place.

## Planning

PL1 - Does your city mandate LEED standards for all new public buildings?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Del Mar</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Encinitas</i>	<b>No</b> - However, the City has been pursuing LEED standards for building upgrades on City owned facilities as well as for proposed new buildings. City Hall is going through the final steps for LEED-EB O&M (Existing Building Operations & Maintenance) certification; plans are being prepared for the next Fire Station (Cardiff) to be built to LEED-Silver specifications; and a new sewer pump station has been designed and will be built to LEED standards.
<i>Oceanside</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Solana Beach</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Vista</i>	<b>No</b> - While Vista does not have a formal mandate for LEED buildings, the City completed two fire stations and a new Civic Center in 2009-2010 totaling approximately \$85M and all of these facilities are LEED certified.

LEED, or Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design, is an internationally recognized green building certification system, developed by the [U.S. Green Building Council \(USGBC\)](http://www.usgbc.org). LEED provides a framework or standards for identifying and implementing practical and measurable green building design, construction, operations and maintenance solutions. The standards can lead to improved environmental and health performance of buildings. LEED certification requires an application process and charges significant fees to receive building certification.

Solana Beach is the only city to mandate that public buildings be built to LEED standards. However, Encinitas is using LEED standards for building upgrades of existing buildings and proposed new municipal buildings. The new and renovated buildings include the Encinitas City Hall and construction of a new Cardiff Fire Station. In addition, Encinitas has a new sewer pump station designed to LEED Standards. While Vista does not have formal mandates, they have build two fire stations and a new Civic Center that have received LEED certification.

## Planning - *continued*

PL2 - Has energy usage by your city been reduced in the last two years?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<b>Yes</b> - Installation of more energy efficient street lighting.
<i>Del Mar</i>	<b>Yes</b> - Voluntary use of energy efficient measures installed by applicants for new development and remodels.
<i>Encinitas</i>	<b>Yes</b> - Currently no one person tracks all city energy usage - which includes City Facilities, Marine Safety Services, Park Lighting, Street Lighting and Traffic Signals. With new facilities that have been added in the last two years overall energy use has increased. However, with the City Hall upgrades, which include: replacing HVAC with a chiller system, PV panels, day lighting, interior and exterior energy efficiency lighting upgrades, and refined system monitoring there has been a 36% reduction in electric energy use over the FY06 baseline. From FY09 to FY10 there was a 4% reduction in electricity and 10% reduction in gas for City buildings including: 5 Fire Stations, City Hall, Library, Public Works, Senior/Community Center. Not included in the calculations for one year reductions are street lights, traffic signals, city parks, or marine safety facilities.
<i>Oceanside</i>	<b>Yes</b> - The City's Water Utilities Department has reduced its electricity and natural gas costs by more than 25% over the past two years, primarily through the capture and usage of methane for power generation.
<i>Solana Beach</i>	<b>Yes</b> - The City is currently in the process of upgrading the HVAC system at City Hall, which will result in a significant reduction in energy use as the HVAC was identified in the City's Energy Management Plan as the highest energy user in any facility. The City is utilizing its ARRA Stimulus money to perform the upgrade.
<i>Vista</i>	<b>No</b> - Estimated savings of 50% from replacement of street lights with LED fixtures.

Energy usage reductions reflect doing more with less and thus reducing resource use, degradation and pollution. It is therefore notable that 5 of 6 cities were able to reduce energy usage in the last two years. The sixth city, Vista, while not reducing overall usage, observed a 50% savings by replacing streetlights with LED fixtures. The energy savings have been due to: installation of energy efficient lighting; upgrades or replacement of HVAC systems; and installation of photovoltaic systems. Oceanside's Water Utilities Department reduced energy use by 25% primarily through the capture and use of methane for power generation.

PL3 - Does your General Plan encourage building new residential buildings near public transportation?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Del Mar</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Encinitas</i>	<b>No</b> - Not currently; however, it is being addressed in the City's Comprehensive General Plan Update process, which is scheduled for local adoption by Winter 2011. The City does have a Downtown Specific Plan in which development standards support transit oriented development (e.g., parking incentives and residential density).
<i>Oceanside</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Solana Beach</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Vista</i>	<b>Yes</b> - Vista is currently updating their General Plan, expected completion date in mid 2011. The update includes changing land use designations near all SPRINTER stations in the City to allow mixed use, high density development consistent with SANDAG's Smart Growth Map.

## Planning - *continued*

California’s Sustainable Communities Planning Act (SB 375) was enacted in 2008 to help California fight global warming by addressing one of the largest and most rapidly growing sources of greenhouse gas emissions, the VMT, or the vehicle miles an average California family travels. One way to achieve this goal would be to link land use and transit development that encourages residential building growth near public transportation.

When asked, half the cities stated that their General Plan encourages residential building growth near public transportation. In the new 2011 General Plan, Vista will change land use designations near all SPRINTER stations and allow mixed use, high density development consistent with SANDAG’s Smart Growth Map. Encinitas will address this issue in their General Plan Update, scheduled for adoption in the winter of 2011. The proposed plan contains development standards that support transit oriented development through parking incentives and residential density.

## Water Conservation

Water is a critical, and limiting resource in our area. Eighty percent of our water supply is imported from the Sacramento-San Joaquin River Delta and the Colorado River. The availability of these imported supplies are dependent on weather conditions, lawsuits and court decisions. Although, new source of water are being developed, they are likely to be quite expensive, and not abundant. Conservation is the best option for preserving our water resources.

<b>WC1 - Does your city require drought tolerant landscaping in new commercial or residential sites?</b>					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes

<b>WC2 - Does your city use drought tolerant or native plants in the landscaping on city property?</b>					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

In the 2008 survey, we found that all cities were active in using drought tolerant planting in municipal projects. A number had educational programs, water recycling initiatives and had begun to plan for implementation of AB1881, the State’s Model Landscape Ordinance (see below Environmental Stewardship). The 2010 survey revealed that five of six cities required drought tolerant landscaping in new commercial or residential sites. Encinitas has adopted the Model Landscape Ordinance. Vista adopted a new Drought Resistant Landscape Ordinance in January 2011 that will require stricter irrigation standards and drought tolerant plant species in all new commercial and industrial projects. Solana Beach, the sixth city will require drought resistant planting in 2011. All cities use drought resistant planting on municipal property except in parts of Encinitas due to the need to protect three endangered plant species.

## Water Conservation - *continued*

WC3 - Does your city use reclaimed water for irrigation?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Del Mar</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Encinitas</i>	<b>Yes</b> – Wherever available. Currently seven out of 18 parks utilize reclaimed water. As more access becomes available through infrastructure expansion additional park sites will be converted to reclaimed water.
<i>Oceanside</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Solana Beach</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Vista</i>	<b>No</b> - Reclaimed water is not currently available in Vista and there is little infrastructure in place. There is currently a study underway for the North County cities to determine the feasibility of increasing the supply of and infrastructure for reclaimed water.

Four of the six cities use reclaimed water for irrigation. Encinitas plans to increase the use of reclaimed water as infrastructure becomes available. Currently, neither Del Mar or Vista use reclaimed water. Vista does not possess the infrastructure needed, but stated there is an ongoing feasibility study to determine whether North County Cities can increase the availability of reclaimed water.

WC4 - Does your city have a policy or ordinance that promotes collection and use of grey water?					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
<b>No</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>No</b>

Greywater is water from your bathroom sinks, showers, tubs, and washing machines. It is not water that has come into contact with feces, either from the toilet or from washing diapers (called “blackwater”). Greywater may contain traces of dirt, food, grease, hair, and certain household cleaning products. While greywater may look “dirty,” it is a safe and even beneficial source of irrigation water in a yard. There are many simple, economical ways to reuse greywater in the landscape. The survey revealed that only Del Mar has a policy that promotes use of greywater. While Vista does not have a policy or ordinance, it does permit greywater use and collection.

## Governance

<b>G01 - Has your city implemented any new sustainable practices in 2009-2010?</b>	
<b>Carlsbad</b>	<b>Yes</b> – Street Light retrofit, increased use of reclaimed water, continued progress and support of the Poseidon Resources’ desalination project in Carlsbad, continued progress and support of a small-scale City operated hydroelectric project.
<b>Del Mar</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Encinitas</b>	<b>Yes</b> – Implemented an Environmentally Preferable Purchasing Policy and Green Cleaning Policy (as a part of LEED-EB O&M); Energy Audits of all major facilities as a part of the SDG&E/SANDAG Energy Road Map; Preparation of Climate Action Plan; received EECBG funds for energy efficient exterior lighting upgrades at Parks, Public Works and Senior/Community Center.
<b>Oceanside</b>	<b>Yes</b> – With funding through the Energy Efficiency and Conservation Block Grant Program, the City has begun weatherization and retrofitting of city facilities as well as upgrading of traffic control devices with smart technology designed to improve traffic flow and improve fuel efficiency.
<b>Solana Beach</b>	<b>Yes</b> – The City has implemented a ban on all 2-stroke gas powered leaf blowers throughout the City, entered into a unique and innovative agreement with NCI to set aside 1,000 acres (roughly the size of the City) of valuable rain forests in Ecuador and Peru for purchase by City residents, joined California Communities JPA for solar financing and installed the first SDG&E approved LED street lights in a residential neighborhood.
<b>Vista</b>	<b>Yes</b> – The City is in the process of switching all street lights on arterials and at major intersections to LED fixtures. In addition, as stated above, the City recently completed two fire stations and a new Civic Center that are all LEED certified buildings.

We were pleased to learn that five of the six cities had implemented new sustainable practices in 2009-2010. The new practices were varied, novel and creative.

Carlsbad implemented a retrofit project to use of higher efficiency streetlights. They increased use of reclaimed water. They continued to support development of a desalination plant. Finally they supported development of a small-scale city operated hydroelectric project.

Encinitas put in place an Environmentally Preferable Purchasing Policy and Green Cleaning Policy. They implemented Energy Audits of all major facilities. They prepared a Climate Action Plan. Finally, they received funds to permit upgrades to energy efficient exterior lighting for municipal parks and the senior center.

Oceanside obtained funding to begin weatherization and retrofitting of city facilities. They have also begun to upgrade traffic control devices with smart technology that is designed to improve traffic flow and thus improve fuel efficiency.

Solana Beach has implemented a ban on all 2-stroke gas powered leaf blowers throughout the city. (The EPA estimates that one hour of operation of a two-stroke motor emits the same amount of hydrocarbon pollution as a modern car that has driven 5,000 miles. Four stroke engines emit 97% less pollution.) Solana Beach has entered into a unique and innovative agreement with Nature and Culture International to offset carbon emission by protecting 1,000 acres of South American rain forests. They have developed a program for solar financing. Finally they were the first to install SDG&E approved LED streetlights in a residential neighborhood.

Vista is in the process of converting all streetlights on arterial and major intersections to LED fixtures. They also recently completed two fire stations and a new civic center that are LEED certified buildings.

## Governance - *continued*

<b>G02 - Has the proportion of the city budget spent on sustainability efforts remained constant or increased since 2009?</b>	
<b>Carlsbad</b>	<b>N/A</b> – The data maintenance, collection, and analysis is not where the City would like it to be in this area, so unfortunately for now the answer is N/A. Hopefully, in the next survey the City can provide more complete information.
<b>Del Mar</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Encinitas</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Oceanside</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Solana Beach</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Vista</b>	<b>Yes</b> – Has remained constant

We were pleased to find that four of six cities have continued to spend at 2009 levels or greater for sustainability efforts. This reflects recognition of the economic, social and environmental importance of sustainability efforts. Carlsbad and Del Mar have not continued to spend at 2009 levels for sustainability endeavors.

<b>G03 - Have the sustainability policies implemented by your city resulted in cost savings?</b>	
<b>Carlsbad</b>	<b>Yes</b> – Our street light retrofit project.
<b>Del Mar</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Encinitas</b>	<b>Yes</b> – While there is an ongoing fine tuning process for the various energy systems at City Hall – energy savings have been realized and expenses have been reduced through actively defaulting all printers (with capability) for duplex printing.
<b>Oceanside</b>	<b>Yes</b> – It is anticipated that aforementioned weatherization and retrofitting efforts will result in cost savings to the City.
<b>Solana Beach</b>	<b>Yes</b> – The retro-fitting of lighting at City facilities to energy efficient fixtures and the installation of LED street lights has reduced energy use and resulted in cost savings.
<b>Vista</b>	<b>Yes</b> – The City has seen cost savings in energy usage and water usage from development of the new Civic Center due to energy saving equipment and facilities integrated into the building and a well for irrigation of the grounds.

As would be hoped, the sustainability actions taken by the cities have resulted in cost savings with the exception of the city of Del Mar. Carlsbad and Solana Beach have observed savings from their streetlight retrofits. Encinitas continues to fine tune energy systems at City Hall to realize greater gains. In addition, they have found that actively defaulting printers to duplex printing has resulted in cost savings. Oceanside expects that their weatherization and retrofitting of municipal buildings will result in cost savings. Vista has seen cost savings through reduced energy and water use in the new civic center due to integrated energy saving equipment and facilities. In addition, water savings have been observed due to installation of a well for grounds irrigation.

# Innovation

IN1 – In the economic downturn that has faced all cities, has your city developed innovative or cost effective programs that promote sustainability?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<b>N/A</b> –All programs and services are developed and implemented in the most cost effective manner possible using innovative means where appropriate. The programs and services are also designed to meet the City’s adopted sustainability principles. A recent specific example of a sustainability project is the conversion of public street lights to a more efficient induction light standard saving the City \$300,000 annually in energy costs.
<i>Del Mar</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Encinitas</i>	<b>Yes</b> – The City has realized savings through sustainable activities such as buying green cleaning products in concentrate form and installing energy efficient hand dryers at City Hall, Library and Sr/Community Center. Savings were realized from reducing paper towel purchases and time needed for replacing paper towel products, as well as minimizing waste.
<i>Oceanside</i>	<b>Yes</b> – City’s Water Utilities Department has been a leader in the development of sustainability measures. 1) Water Utilities has implemented it methane capture process that supplies supplemental energy for wastewater treatment at its San Luis Rey wastewater treatment facility. 2) In conjunction with a private vendor, Water Utilities will soon install a solar power generation facility adjacent to its San Luis Rey wastewater treatment facility. 3) Water Utilities continues to expand local water harvesting with the goal of supplying 30% of the City’s total water needs by 2030.
<i>Solana Beach</i>	<b>Yes</b> – The City entered into a unique and innovative partnership with TREX Inc to implement a plastic bag recycling program, the first of its kind. The City established several drop-off locations throughout the community where residents can drop-off their plastic bags for recycling. City Staff and volunteers collect the bags and compress them into bales, which are then picked up by TREX Inc. to be recycled into high quality, durable building materials, domestically. TREX pays the City a nominal amount for the plastic bags. It’s a win-win situation for both the City and TREX Inc.
<i>Vista</i>	<b>No</b> – We have not identified many programs promoting sustainability that reduce costs.

The economic downturn has forced cities to be creative with fewer resources. We wondered if cities found innovative or cost effective programs to promote sustainability. Three of the six cities were able to identify resourceful and unique ways to promote sustainability in their communities. Encinitas realized savings through buying green cleaning products in concentrated form. They also achieved savings through installation of energy efficient hand dryers in municipal buildings. Oceanside’s water utilities department implemented a methane capture process that supplies supplemental energy for wastewater treatment. The water utilities are in the process of installing solar photovoltaic power panels adjacent to the wastewater treatment facility. The water utilities also plan to expand local water harvesting with the goal of supplying 30% of the city’s needs by 2030.

Solana Beach entered a partnership with TREX Inc, to implement a plastic bag-recycling program, the first of its kind. TREX converts the collected bags into high quality, durable building materials for the domestic market. The city is paid a nominal fee for the plastic bags. It is a win-win solution for all parties.

## Solid Waste

SW1 - Does your city require your green waste contractor to compost yard waste?					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
No	No	No	Yes	Yes	No

Green yard waste from recycling bins is being buried in county landfills by the ton. It's happening in several communities in San Diego County. The collected green waste is shredded and then called Alternative Daily Cover, or ADC. As ADC, it is considered by California to be recycled material. Landfills use to cover garbage to reduce rat infestation and noxious odors. However, in landfills this "recycled" green waste degrades like all the adjacent trash and creates methane gas, a very potent green house gas as this KPBS news item suggests:

[Tons of 'Recycled' Yard Waste Being Dumped in San Diego Landfills](#)

There are, however a number of green waster recyclers that use the green waste to produce mulch, compost and topsoil. San Diego County provides a list of [recycling guides](#) where the Green Waste Recycling Guide can be downloaded in pdf format. In our 2008 survey, Oceanside was the only city to compost their green waste. In our current survey, Solana Beach and Oceanside reported that they compost their city's yard waste.

SW2 - Does your city mandate recycling of building debris after building demolition or renovation?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	No
<i>Del Mar</i>	Yes
<i>Encinitas</i>	Yes – The City requires a minimum 60% diversion rate via a Construction & Demolition Debris Ordinance (Municipal Code Chapter 11.22) which was adopted by the City Council in 2008.
<i>Oceanside</i>	Yes
<i>Solana Beach</i>	Yes
<i>Vista</i>	Yes – Vista's ordinance requires recycling of all construction debris, which is tracked as part of the building permit process.

Five of six cities now mandate recycling of building debris after building demolition or renovation. In the previous survey the mandates were recommendations or under consideration. Encinitas requires a 60% diversion rate. Only Carlsbad currently does not mandate recycling of building debris.

## Environmental

ES1 - Is your city implementing AB 1881?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<b>Yes</b> - The City adopted a water efficient landscape ordinance in early 2010 that discourages water waste and promotes low-water use and native landscaping.
<i>Del Mar</i>	<b>Yes</b> - In the process of preparing policies and regulatory amendments.
<i>Encinitas</i>	<b>Yes</b> - In 2010 the city enacted the City of Encinitas Water Efficient Landscape Regulations (Municipal Code Chapter 23.26, Ordinance 2010-05), which was based off of the Countywide model ordinance developed by the County Water Authority.
<i>Oceanside</i>	<b>Yes</b> - The City has incorporated into its own landscape ordinance those components of the state's updated model ordinance that address irrigation system efficiency and water budgeting.
<i>Solana Beach</i>	<b>Yes</b> - The City is currently implementing the State's Model Landscape Ordinance. Staff is developing a local ordinance that will be more stringent than the State's policy and adapted to incorporate local conditions. This local ordinance is scheduled to go to City Council for consideration in February 2011.
<i>Vista</i>	<b>Yes</b> - All landscape plans for commercial and industrial development are required to comply with the State law, and we are adopting a new landscape ordinance (as described above) in January 2011.

California Assembly Bill 1881 is the Model Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance (MWELo) that went into effect January 1, 2010. AB1881 is mainly aimed at irrigation technology that will solve common problems that lead to excessive water waste. It is primarily aimed at new construction and commercial landscapers. It only applies to single-family homes with large gardens. It provides information useful for water budgeting, planning and implementation of any water-wise garden.

All cities in the survey reported that they are implementing AB 1881. Carlsbad adopted an ordinance in early 2010 that discourages water waste and promotes low-water use and native landscaping. Del Mar is in the process of preparing policies and regulatory amendments. Encinitas enacted an ordinance that was based on the countywide model ordinance developed by the County Water Authority. Oceanside has incorporated into its city landscape ordinance those components of AB 1881 that address irrigation system efficiency and water budgeting. Solana Beach is currently implementing AB 1881. City staff is developing a local ordinance that will be more stringent than the State's policy and adapted to incorporate local conditions. Vista has adopted an ordinance that makes all commercial and industrial landscape plans compliant with the state law.

ES2 - When approving new developments, do you require consideration of the existing landscape and how it will be incorporated or made a part of the new project?					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>

We were pleased to learn that all the cities surveyed consider existing landscape and how it will be incorporated or made part of the new project when approving new developments. In Vista, new projects are required to conserve native area when feasible, as determined by the project biologist. We anticipate this will sustain native species and its associated ecology.

## Environmental – *continued*

<b>ES3 - Are you involved in any Habitat Conservation Management Plan?</b>	
<b>Carlsbad</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Del Mar</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Encinitas</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Oceanside</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Solana Beach</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Vista</b>	<b>Yes</b> – Vista is part of the subregional MHCP, but we have not adopted a Subarea Plan yet due to fiscal constraints in implementing the plan.

When asked whether their city was involved in any Habitat Conservation Management Plan, five of the six cities said yes. Vista stated that it was part of the sub regional Multiple Habitat Conservation Program (MHCP), but had not adopted a plan due to fiscal constraints. Only Solana Beach stated that it was not involved in a local habitat conservation plan. However, the city did state it had a program to conserve habitat in South America (see *Governance* action area).

<b>ES4 - Does your city have an ordinance that requires use of biodegradable products, such as natural pest controls or non-chemical fertilizers to minimize the flow of toxic materials into our waterways?</b>	
<b>Carlsbad</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Del Mar</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Encinitas</b>	<b>No</b> -- There is no ordinance, however City Integrated Pest Management Plan practices for Parks & Rec and Public Works require the use of natural pest control and other non-toxic product
<b>Oceanside</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Solana Beach</b>	<b>No</b> – However, the City requires its contracted landscaping company to utilize IPM at all City facilities, parks and in the medians.
<b>Vista</b>	<b>No</b> – Not codified, but adhered to for the majority of Public Works projects.

Run-off from man-made non-porous surfaces, such as roads, sidewalks, roofs, parking lots and industrial sites can be a significant contributor to waterways pollution. The non-porous surface run-off is not filtered, or its contaminants biodegraded by percolating through soil. Chemicals from urban storm water run-off pose a potential threat to human health and an even greater threat to aquatic organisms. We asked the cities whether they had ordinances that require biodegradable products, such as natural pest controls or non-chemical fertilizers to minimize the flow of toxic materials into our waterways. None of the cities had ordinances in place. However, both Encinitas and Solana Beach utilized Integrated Pest Management (IPM) practices that use natural pest control and non-toxic products in their city parks. Solana Beach also uses IPM practices in all city facilities and road medians. Encinitas also uses IPM practices in public works. Vista adheres to IPM practices for the majority of public works projects.

## Community Involvement

Education and citizen participation is an important component in creating a sustainable community. It is also important to monitor progress to determine effectiveness of policies, practices and ordinances. An informed and engaged citizenry brings vitality, and positive change to cities.

<b>C1 - Does your city participate in public educational forums on sustainability? If yes, do you have a Spanish version?</b>					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No

Four of six cities participated in public educational forums on sustainability. In Encinitas, forums and presentations have been coordinated for the public as a part of their Comprehensive General Plan Update process. Solana Beach, Oceanside and Del Mar had Spanish versions, while Encinitas did not. Carlsbad and Vista did not have sustainability educational forums

<b>C2 - Does your city require periodic reports from each department regarding city mandated sustainability efforts?</b>					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
No	No	No	No	Yes	No

We found that only Solana Beach monitored sustainability efforts in each city department.

<b>C3 - Is there any staff or public committee that monitors sustainability efforts and is responsible for tabulating data and bringing the results to the Council?</b>					
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<i>Del Mar</i>	<i>Encinitas</i>	<i>Oceanside</i>	<i>Solana Beach</i>	<i>Vista</i>
No	Yes	No	No	Yes	No

We asked whether the cities have staff or public committee(s) that tracked sustainability efforts and kept the city council informed. Solana Beach and Del Mar had staff or a public committee that monitored sustainability efforts and reported findings to the city council. While Encinitas does not monitor sustainability efforts, it does have an Environmental Commission that produced an annual Work Plan for the Council's consideration and provides periodic reports.

## Community Involvement – *continued*

C4- Are the results of your city's sustainability efforts made available to the public via written reports or website links?	
<i>Carlsbad</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Del Mar</i>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Encinitas</i>	<b>Yes</b> – Environmental Commission activities/efforts can be tracked on the City website. Plans have been developed for expanding the tracking with the City's updated website: <a href="http://www.ci.encinitas.ca.us/">http://www.ci.encinitas.ca.us/</a>
<i>Oceanside</i>	<b>No</b>
<i>Solana Beach</i>	<b>Yes</b> – <a href="http://www.cityofsolanabeach.org/csite/cms/301.htm">http://www.cityofsolanabeach.org/csite/cms/301.htm</a>
<i>Vista</i>	<b>Yes</b> – The Emissions Inventory prepared for the City is available in written form. There has not been a comprehensive study or report prepared to document Vista sustainability efforts to date

The results of the sustainability efforts are available to the public in four of the six cities surveyed. Carlsbad and Oceanside do not provide the public with results of their sustainability efforts. Encinitas' efforts monitored by the Environmental Commission, are available on the city website. Encinitas plans to expand tracking with the city's updated website. Solana Beach provides information on its website. Vista has its Emissions Inventory available in written form. A comprehensive report on its sustainability efforts does not exist.

### Conclusion

The 2010 survey of sustainable practices of North Coast San Diego communities was enlightening. Since our last 2008 survey, all cities have made progress toward creating sustainable communities. It is admirable that the cities have continued to pursue sustainability efforts in the face of a challenging economic environment. The innovation and creativity used to strive for sustainable solutions was interesting and noteworthy. We found that cities are making efforts to implement the state mandates AB 32, the Global Warming Solutions Act and SB 375, the Sustainable Communities Planning Act as well as AB 1881, the Model Water Efficiency Landscape Ordinance.

## **Appendix 1**

The survey questions were formulated by the LWVNCSD Sustainability Issues group from September 2009 through June, 2010. The survey was composed of 25 questions. Two questions were deleted from the final analysis in our report. One question became irrelevant because it referred to a discontinued SANDAG program. A second question was deleted because there was insufficient information available to give definitive answers. LWV members submitted the survey to the cities in September to October of 2010. The results were returned in December, 2010 through March 2011. Issues group members analyzed the results and prepared the report.

## **Appendix 2**

The population and operating budget for each survey city is as follows: Carlsbad, 105,325, \$188M; Del Mar, 4,161, \$19M; Encinitas, 59,518, \$88M; Oceanside, 167,086, \$112M; Solana Beach, 12,867, \$25M; Vista, 93,834, \$66M

## Glossary

**ARRA** – The American Recovery and Reinvestment Act

**CARB** – California Air Resources Board

**EECBG** – Energy Efficiency and Conservation Block Grants

**GHG** – Green House Gas

**Greywater** – In household context, greywater is the leftover water from baths, showers, hand basins and washing machines only

**HVAC** – Heating, Ventilation, Air Conditioning

**ICLEI** – Local Governments for Sustainability

**IEAP** – International Local Government GHG Emissions Analysis Protocol

**IPM** – Integrated Pest Management

**LED** – Light-emitting Diode

**LEED** – Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design

**LEED-EB:O&M** – Existing Buildings: Operations and Maintenance

**LGOP** – Local Government Operations Protocol

**MHCP** – Multiple Habitat Conservation Program

**NCI** – Nature and Culture International

**SANDAG** – San Diego Association of Governments.



**LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS**  
**North County San Diego**

P. O. Box 131272 Carlsbad, CA 92013-1272